

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
BOARD OF EDITORS	—	v
FOREWORD	vii	ix
PREFACE	—	xi
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiii	—
SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS	xxi	xiii
GLOSSARY	xlix	—

PART I. INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1. OVERVIEW AND HISTORY	3	3
I. Recognition of Age Discrimination in Employment	3	—
II. The Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA)		
Legislative History	5	—
III. Amendments to the ADEA	9	—
A. Expansion of Coverage	9	—
1. Employers With 20 or More Employees	9	—
2. Citizens Working Abroad	9	—
3. State and Municipal Employees	10	—
4. Federal Employees	10	—
B. Increase in the Age Ceiling	11	—
C. Bona Fide Executives and High-Level Policymakers	12	—
D. Tenured University Employees	12	—
E. Fire Department and Law Enforcement Employees	14	—
F. Health Insurance and Pension Benefits	14	—
G. Statute of Limitations	16	—
H. Additional Amendments	16	—
IV. The Statutory Scheme	17	—
A. Employees Protected Under the ADEA	17	—
B. Respondents Covered Under the ADEA	18	—
C. Prohibited Practices	18	—
D. ADEA Defenses	19	—
E. Enforcement	21	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
F. The Administrative Process	21	—
G. Remedies	22	—
H. Education and Research Programs	23	—
V. Proving Age Discrimination	24	—
A. Disparate Treatment	25	—
B. Adverse Impact	26	—
CHAPTER 2. DEMOGRAPHICS OF AN AGING LABOR FORCE	27	5
I. The ADEA's Protected Age Group	27	—
II. Population Projections	27	—
III. Labor Force Projections	30	—
IV. Labor Force Participation Rates	32	—
V. Retirement	33	—
PART II. THE PARTIES		
CHAPTER 3. PERSONS PROTECTED UNDER THE ADEA	39	9
I. Who May File a Charge Under the ADEA	39	10
A. Certain Employees Over 40 Years of Age	39	10
1. Overview [New Topic]	—	10
2. Former Employees [New Topic]	—	10
3. Licensees [New Topic]	—	11
4. Government Employees [New Topic]	—	12
B. Corporate Directors and Officers	41	—
C. U.S. Citizens and Noncitizens Depending on Location of Employment	41	—
D. Persons Filing on Behalf of Others	42	—
II. Who May Not File a Charge Under the ADEA	45	12
A. State Employees	45	—
B. Certain Federal Employees	45	—
C. Independent Contractors	46	12
D. Owners, Directors, and Officers	48	14
E. Partners	49	14
F. Uniformed Armed Forces	49	15
G. Native American Tribes	50	15
H. Relatives of Employees [New Topic]	—	15
III. Who Is Exempted From the Protection of the ADEA	50	15
A. Bona Fide Executives and High-Level Policymakers	50	—
B. Firefighters and Law Enforcement Officers	52	15
C. Tenured Faculty	53	—
CHAPTER 4. AGAINST WHOM A CHARGE MAY BE FILED UNDER THE ADEA	55	17
I. Employers	55	17
A. Definition of Private Sector Employer	55	17

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. Definition of Employee for Purposes of Defining Employer	56	18
C. Determining Who Is the Employer	57	—
1. Integrated Enterprise Theory	57	—
2. Joint Employer Theory	60	—
3. Agency Theory	61	—
D. Individual Liability	61	—
E. Extraterritorial Employment by U.S. Companies	62	—
F. Coverage of Foreign Employers	63	—
G. Religious Institution Employers	64	—
H. Native American Tribe Employers	65	—
I. Public Employers	65	18
II. Labor Organizations and Apprenticeship Programs	66	19
III. Employment Agencies	67	—
IV. “Or Any Combination Thereof”	68	—

PART III. THE BASIS FOR AGE DISCRIMINATION

CHAPTER 5. AGE AS THE BASIS OF THE DISCRIMINATION	73	23
I. Scope of Ages Covered by the ADEA	73	23
A. Legislative History of Age as a Protected Basis	73	—
B. The Floor—Age 40	74	—
1. On the Basis of Age—No Age Floor	74	—
2. An Age Floor Below Age 40	74	—
3. An Age Floor Above Age 40	75	—
C. The Ceiling	76	—
D. Retaliation	77	23
II. Age as a Mutable Characteristic	77	24
III. Distinctions Between Age and Age-Related Factors	79	24
IV. Reverse Discrimination	80	25
A. Overview	80	—
B. Claims by Younger Employees	81	25
1. Employees Over Age 40	81	25
2. Employees Under Age 40	83	—
C. Rejection of Duty to Prefer Older Workers	84	25
CHAPTER 6. RETALIATION	87	27
I. Introduction	87	—
II. The Parties	89	28
A. Person Retaliated Against	89	28
B. Defendants	90	28
C. Timeliness	91	—
III. The Participation Clause	92	28
A. Activities Protected as Participation	92	28
B. Challenged Employment Practice Need Not Be Unlawful	93	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
IV. The Opposition Clause	93	29
A. Overview	93	29
B. Legality of the Challenged Employment Practice	95	29
C. Reasonableness of the Method of Complaining	96	—
V. The Adverse Employment Action	97	30
VI. The Causal Connection	101	30
A. Employer's Knowledge	101	30
B. Methods of Demonstrating the Causal Connection	103	31
1. Direct Evidence	103	—
2. Circumstantial Evidence	103	31
C. The Degree to Which Retaliatory Action Must Be Motivated by Protected Activity	105	—
D. Mixed-Motive Cases	106	—
VII. The Employer's Rebuttal	108	—
VIII. Plaintiff's Proof of Pretext	110	31
IX. Remedies Under Section 4(d)	111	—
A. Preliminary Injunctive Relief Available to EEOC in ADEA Cases	111	—
B. Monetary Relief	111	—

PART IV. THE ADVERSE EMPLOYMENT ACTION

CHAPTER 7. HIRING	115	35
I. History	115	—
II. Creating the Applicant Pool	117	36
A. Introduction	117	—
B. Nonapplicants and the Problem of Chilling	118	—
C. Job Opportunity Advertising	119	36
D. Word-of-Mouth Recruitment	121	—
E. Nepotism	122	—
F. Walk-In Applicants	123	—
III. Selecting from the Applicant Pool	123	36
A. Preemployment Inquiries	123	36
B. The Selection	125	36
IV. Age as a Bona Fide Occupational Qualification for Hiring	125	36
V. Disparate Treatment Theory of Proof	130	37
A. Individual Case Based on Inferential Proof	130	37
1. Overview	130	37
2. Whether Plaintiff Was Qualified	132	37
3. Whether Applicant Was Passed Over in Favor of a Younger Person	132	37
B. Pattern or Practice Model	134	38
C. The Direct Evidence, Mixed-Motive Model	135	38
VI. Adverse Impact Theory of Proof	137	39

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
A. Overview	137	39
B. The Showing of Adverse Impact	139	—
C. Defense [New Heading Name]	141	40
CHAPTER 8. PROMOTIONS	143	41
I. What Constitutes a Promotion	143	—
II. The Application Process	143	—
III. The Plaintiff’s Qualifications	145	—
IV. The Plaintiff’s Experience	152	—
V. Subjective Criteria	152	—
VI. Statistical Proof: The Qualified Potential Applicant Pool	154	—
VII. Remedies	157	—
CHAPTER 9. MONETARY COMPENSATION	159	43
I. Introduction	159	—
II. Salary as a Factor in Failure-to-Hire Cases	160	—
III. Salary and Wage Discrimination	161	43
IV. Salary as a Factor in Reduction-in-Force Cases	164	—
V. Salary as a Factor in Discharge Cases	165	44
VI. Proving Wage Discrimination	168	44
VII. The Employer’s Defense	168	—
CHAPTER 10. EMPLOYEE BENEFIT PROGRAMS	171	45
I. History	171	45
II. The Older Workers Benefit Protection Act	174	46
III. Discrimination in Benefits After ADEA Amendment by the OWBPA	176	47
A. Overview	176	—
B. Bona Fide Plan	177	—
C. Plan Terms	178	—
D. Equal Cost Defense	178	—
E. Specific Benefits	180	47
1. Retirement/Pension Benefits	180	47
2. Severance Benefits	181	—
3. Life Insurance	182	—
4. Long-Term Disability	183	—
5. Retiree Health Benefits	184	48
F. Benefit Packaging	186	—
IV. Cash Balance Plans	186	49
A. Applicable Statutory Provisions	187	49
B. Mechanics of Cash Balance Plans	188	50
1. The Nature of Cash Balance Plans	188	50
2. Conversions	191	—
3. Establishment of New Cash Balance Plan	192	—

CHAPTER 11. EXIT INCENTIVES AND EARLY RETIREMENT PROGRAMS	195	53
I. Introduction	196	—
II. Constructive Discharge Issues	197	54
A. Overview	197	54
B. Factors Bearing on Voluntariness	199	54
1. Adequate Time to Consider Offer	199	54
2. Absence of Coercion	200	54
3. Program Description	202	—
C. Burden of Proving on Voluntariness	204	—
D. Consistency with the Purpose(s) of the ADEA	204	55
E. Exit Incentive Strategies	207	—
1. As a Prelude to Reductions in Force	207	—
2. As a Strategy Unrelated to Other Employer Actions	207	—
a. “Stand-Alone” Strategy	207	—
b. Tenured Faculty	207	—
3. In Conjunction with Reductions in Force	207	—
III. Types of Exit Incentive Programs	210	—
A. Voluntary Resignation Programs	210	—
B. Voluntary Retirement Programs	210	—
IV. Exit Incentive Program Eligibility	211	—
A. Targeting Specific Groups	211	—
B. Legal Constraints on Targeting Exit Incentives	213	—
C. The Window Period	213	—
D. Exclusions from Eligibility	214	—
1. Release Requirements	214	—
2. Minimum and Maximum Age Limitations	215	—
3. Discretion to Reject Applicants	215	—
CHAPTER 12. MANDATORY RETIREMENT	217	57
I. History	217	—
II. Defenses	219	—
A. Age as a Bona Fide Occupational Qualification	219	—
1. Age Limitation as Reasonably Necessary to the Essence of the Business	220	—
2. Age as a Proxy for Job Qualification	221	—
B. Compliance With Federal Age-Based Rules	222	—
C. “Qualification” Required of Employees of All Ages	223	—
III. Equal Protection and Due Process Claims	224	—
A. The Equal Protection Clause	224	—
B. The Due Process Clause	226	—
IV. Statutory Exemptions to the ADEA’s Prohibition of Age-Based Mandatory Retirement	227	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
A. Executives and High-Level Policymakers	227	—
B. State and Local Firefighters and Law Enforcement Officers	229	—
C. Former Exemption for Bona Fide Employee Benefit Plans	229	—
D. Former Exemption of Tenured Faculty	230	—
E. Federal Employees	231	—
F. State and Municipal Employees	232	—
 CHAPTER 13. REDUCTIONS IN FORCE	 235	 59
I. Disparate Treatment Claims	235	60
A. Prima Facie Case	235	60
1. Job Elimination or Redistribution [New Topic]	—	60
2. Alternative Jobs [New Topic]	—	60
3. Causal Connection [New Topic]	—	60
4. Comparator Group [New Topic]	—	61
B. Employer’s Legitimate Nondiscriminatory Reasons	241	—
C. The Pretext Phase	243	61
1. Ageist Remarks [New Topic]	—	61
2. Inconsistent Reasons [New Topic]	—	61
3. Subjective Criteria [New Topic]	—	63
D. Mixed-Motive Claims [New Topic]	—	63
E. Post-Trial Litigation [New Topic]	—	63
II. Adverse Impact Claims	248	64
A. Pleadings	248	64
B. Prima Facie Case	249	64
1. Comparator Group	250	—
2. Sample Size	251	—
3. Relevant Time Frame	251	—
4. Significant Impact	252	—
5. Policy or Practice [New Topic]	—	64
6. Causal Connection [New Topic]	—	64
C. Job-Related and Business Necessity	253	—
D. Reasonable Factor Other Than Age [New Topic]	—	65
E. Alternative with Less Adverse Impact [Newly Numbered Topic]	—	65
 CHAPTER 14. HARASSMENT	 257	 67
I. Introduction	257	—
A. Harassment as an Adverse Employment Action Under the ADEA	257	—
B. Title VII Harassment Law as Applicable to ADEA Harassment Cases	259	—
II. Elements of Prima Facie Cases of Age Harassment	261	67

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
A. Membership in a Protected Group	261	—
B. The Adverse Employment Action	261	67
1. To Be Actionable Harassment Must Be Severe or Pervasive	261	—
2. Failure to Prove Actionable Harassment	264	67
3. Unwelcomeness	265	—
4. The Subjective Standard	266	—
5. The Objective Standard	266	—
C. The Causal Connection	267	—
D. Employer Responsibility	269	68
1. Automatic Liability [Replacement Topic]	—	68
2. Definition of “Supervisor” [Replacement Topic]	—	69
3. Automatic Vicarious Liability [Replacement Topic]	—	69
4. Conditional Vicarious Liability [Replacement Topic]	—	71
5. Negligence [Replacement Topic]	—	73
III. Harassment as Evidence of Other Forms of Discrimination	274	—
IV. Claims by the Alleged Harasser	275	—
 CHAPTER 15. CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE	 277	 77
I. Introduction	277	78
II. The Requirement of Intolerable Working Conditions	278	78
A. Objective and Subjective Standards	278	78
B. Definition of “Intolerable Conditions”	280	—
C. Types of Employment Action	281	78
1. Failure to Promote	281	—
2. Offers of Early Retirement	281	78
3. Loss of Benefits [Renamed Topic]	—	79
4. Work Schedule Changes [Renamed Topic]	282	79
5. Demotions or Decreases in Responsibilities	283	—
6. Harassment and Other Adverse Treatment	284	79
7. Reasonable Belief That Plaintiff Would Be Discharged [New Topic]	—	80
III. The Causal Connection	285	—
A. The Connection Between Age and Intolerable Conditions	285	—
B. The Connection Between Intolerable Conditions and the Resignation	286	—
IV. The Employer’s Role in Creating or Permitting Intolerable Conditions	286	81
A. Employer’s Intent	286	81
B. Plaintiff’s Complaint to Employer and Employer’s Corrective Action	288	—
C. Plaintiff’s Burden	289	—
V. Constructive Discharge As a Tangible Employment Action	290	81
VI. Remedies	291	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
CHAPTER 16. DISCHARGE	293	83
I. Introduction	293	—
II. Disparate Treatment Discharge Cases	294	83
A. The Allocation of Proof	294	—
B. Plaintiff’s Prima Facie Case	296	83
1. Plaintiff Over Age 40	298	—
2. The Adverse Employment Action [Renamed Topic]	298	83
3. The Causal Connection	299	84
C. Employer’s Legitimate Nondiscriminatory Reason	299	—
D. Plaintiff’s Burden to Show Pretext	300	84
1. Discharge Process [New Topic]	—	84
2. Ageist Comments [New Topic]	—	85
3. Statistics [New Topic]	—	88
III. Adverse Impact Discharge Cases	304	88
A. Adverse Impact and Reasonable Factors Other than Age	304	88
B. Reasonable Factor Other than Age—Cost Justification	306	89
IV. Litigation of Discharge Cases	309	—
A. Suggestions to Plaintiffs	309	—
B. Suggestions to Defendants	310	—
 CHAPTER 17. SPECIAL ISSUES FOR UNIONS AND APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS	 317	 91
I. The Union as Employer	317	—
II. The Union as a Labor Organization	319	—
A. Overview	319	—
B. Union Referrals	320	—
C. Grievance Handling	320	—
D. Bargaining	321	—
E. Retaliation	322	—
III. A Union’s Joint Liability With the Employer	322	—
A. Terms of a Collective Bargaining Agreement	322	—
B. Acquiescing in Employer Discrimination	324	—
C. Inducing Employer Discrimination	324	—
IV. The NLRA and ADEA Exclusivity	325	—
A. The NLRA as a Source of Relief for Breach of the Duty of Fair Representation	 325	 —
1. Duty of Fair Representation	325	—
2. Breach of the Duty of Fair Representation	326	—
B. The ADEA as the Exclusive Remedy for Age Discrimination Claims	 327	 —
V. Procedural Issues	328	92
A. Charge-Filing Requirements	328	92
B. Unions as Parties	328	92
1. Union as a Plaintiff	328	—

	<i>Main</i> <i>Volume</i>	<i>Supple-</i> <i>ment</i>
2. Union as an Additional Defendant	330	92
C. Preemption	330	—
D. Arbitration of Age Discrimination Claims	332	—
E. Remedies	332	—
1. Monetary Relief	332	—
2. Equitable Relief	333	—
VI. Apprenticeship Programs	334	92
 CHAPTER 18. EMPLOYMENT AGENCIES	 335	 93
I. Introduction	335	—
II. Definition of an Employment Agency	336	—
A. Statutory Definition	336	—
B. “For an Employer” Requirement	337	—
C. “Principal Function” Requirement	337	—
D. Scope of Coverage	338	—
III. Employment Agencies in Their Role as Employment Agencies	 340	 —
A. Initial Processing of Applicants	340	—
B. Acceptance of Discriminatory Job Orders	341	—
C. “Help-Wanted” Advertisements	341	—
D. Job Referrals	343	—
IV. State as Employment Agency	343	—
V. Defenses	344	—
A. The Causal Connection	344	—
B. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification	344	—
C. Reasonable Factor Other Than Age	345	—
VI. Employment Agency as Employer	346	—
VII. EEOC Investigations of Alleged Unlawful Practices	347	—
VIII. Remedies	348	—

PART V. THE CAUSAL CONNECTION

 CHAPTER 19. DISPARATE TREATMENT	 351	 97
I. The Theory	352	—
II. Proof of Disparate Treatment Through Circumstantial Evidence	 352	 98
A. Overview	352	98
B. Plaintiff’s Burden of Proof	356	98
1. General Rule	356	98
2. The Law Before <i>Reeves v. Sanderson Plumbing Products</i>	 356	 —
3. The Supreme Court’s Decision in <i>Reeves</i>	360	—
III. The Prima Facie Case	363	99
A. Overview	363	99

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. Plaintiff’s Qualifications	366	99
C. Factors Suggesting a Causal Connection	370	101
1. Replacement by Someone “Younger”	370	101
2. Shifting Duties as Constituting Replacement by Someone “Younger”	372	103
3. Comparative Evidence	373	103
4. Employer False Statements and Inconsistencies	377	104
5. Age-Related Data, Retirement Date, and Retirement Inquiries	381	104
6. Plaintiff’s Good Performance	382	—
7. Age-Based Animus by Non-Decisionmaker	383	104
8. Age Discrimination by Employer Against Other Employees	383	105
9. Hiring or Promoting Employee Over Age 40	384	105
10. Same Actor and Time Frame	385	105
11. Age-Related Comments	387	105
12. Statistical Evidence	388	106
IV. Defendant’s Articulation of a Nondiscriminatory Reason	389	106
A. The Nondiscriminatory Reason	389	106
B. Unfair or Arbitrary Reason	394	107
V. Plaintiff’s Proof of Pretext	397	108
VI. Proof of Disparate Treatment Through Direct Evidence in Mixed-Motive Cases	401	111
A. Overview	401	111
B. Direct Evidence in Mixed-Motive Cases—The <i>Price</i> <i>Waterhouse</i> Standard	402	—
C. The 1991 Civil Rights Act Modifications	405	112
D. Application of <i>Price Waterhouse</i> to the ADEA	405	112
1. Plaintiff’s Production of Direct Evidence	405	112
2. Employer’s Burden to Show Same Decision Would Have Occurred	410	114
3. Modified <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Approach [New Topic]	—	114
CHAPTER 20. ADVERSE IMPACT	413	117
I. History of the Adverse Impact Model of Proof	414	—
II. Application of Adverse Impact Model of Proof to ADEA	416	118
A. Overview	416	118
B. Similarity to Title VII	419	118
C. Legislative History	419	—
D. The Civil Rights Act of 1991 Did Not Amend ADEA	420	118
E. Reasonable Factor Other Than Age Provision	422	119
F. Remedies	423	—
G. Policy Considerations	424	—
III. Application of Adverse Impact Model of Proof to Claims by Federal Employees	427	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
IV. Elements of Proof in Adverse Impact ADEA Cases	427	119
A. Overview	427	119
1. Prima Facie Case	428	—
2. Job-Related/Business Necessity	428	—
3. Alternative With Less Adverse Impact	428	—
B. The Plaintiff’s Prima Facie Case	428	120
1. Threshold Showing of Adverse Impact	428	—
2. Appropriate Method of Comparison	431	—
3. Internal v. External Comparison Groups	431	—
a. External Labor Pool	431	—
b. Internal Labor Pool	432	—
c. Qualified Workforce	432	—
4. Sample Size	433	—
5. Subgroups of the Protected Group	433	—
6. “Bottom-Line” Statistics	435	—
C. The Employer’s Defense	438	120
1. Response to the Prima Facie Case	438	—
2. Response to Plaintiff’s Statistical Evidence	439	—
3. Job Relatedness and Business Necessity	440	120
4. Reasonable Factor Other Than Age	446	—
5. Bona Fide Seniority System	446	—
D. Less Discriminatory Alternatives	446	120

PART VI. JURISDICTION AND PROCEDURE

CHAPTER 21. EEOC STRUCTURE, JURISDICTION, AND PROCESS	451	123
I. EEOC Structure	452	—
II. EEOC Statutory Jurisdiction	452	—
III. EEOC Administrative Functions	453	124
A. Rulemaking Power	453	—
B. Formal Interpretations	454	124
C. Informal Interpretations	455	—
D. EEOC Posting Requirements	456	—
E. Records, Reports, and Document Preservation	456	—
IV. EEOC Enforcement Process	457	124
A. Charge Processing System	457	124
1. History	457	—
2. Who May File a Charge	458	—
3. Filing a Charge, Timeliness, Amendments	458	—
4. Charge Intake	459	—
5. Allegations, Basis, and Parties	460	—
6. Amending the Charge or Filing a New Charge	461	—
7. Retaliation	462	—
8. Keeping the EEOC Informed	462	124
B. State FEP Filing and Dual Filing	462	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
C. Notice or Service of the Charge on the Respondent	463	—
D. Representation by Attorneys	463	—
E. Filing Suit Before Completion of the EEOC Charge Process	464	—
F. Respondent’s Response to the Charge	464	—
1. Initial Response	464	—
2. Prevent Retaliation	465	—
3. Preserve All Records	465	—
G. Respondent’s Investigation and Position Statement	465	124
H. Administrative Closures	466	—
I. Predetermination Settlement	467	—
J. EEOC Investigations	468	—
K. EEOC Determination	470	—
L. EEOC Conciliation	471	—
V. EEOC Files and Findings	472	—
A. Access to EEOC Files	472	—
1. The Freedom of Information Act	472	—
2. What the EEOC Must Remove From the File Before Disclosure	474	—
B. Admissibility Into Evidence of EEOC Filings and Findings	474	—
CHAPTER 22. TIMELINESS AND SUFFICIENCY OF ADEA ADMINISTRATIVE CHARGE	475	125
I. Requirements of Timely State FEP and EEOC Charge Filing	476	126
A. Filing Period of 180 or 300 Days	476	—
B. Who May File a Charge	476	—
C. What Constitutes a Charge	477	126
D. State FEP Exhaustion	478	—
E. Who Is Entitled to 300 Days	479	—
1. Time for Filing	479	—
2. Relevant State for Filing	479	—
II. When the Charge and Amendments Are Filed	480	—
III. Charge Preceding Litigation	481	126
A. Charge Preceding Individual Litigation Under Section 7(c)(1)	481	—
B. Joining a Collective Action	482	—
C. Piggybacking Under the Single Filing Rule in Noncollective Actions	482	126
1. Nature and Timeliness of Piggybacking	482	126
2. Availability of Single Filing Rule	483	126
3. Requirements for Application of Single Filing Rule	484	127
a. Notice to Defendant: Similarly Situated and Class Allegations	484	127
b. Timeliness	486	127

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
IV. Notice or Service of the Charge on the Respondent	486	—
V. When the Unlawful Employment Practice Occurred	486	127
A. Individual Employment Acts	486	127
B. Employment Policies and Seniority Systems	490	—
1. Employment Policies	490	—
2. Seniority Systems	492	—
C. Continuing Violations	493	127
VI. Tolling of the Charge Filing Period and Estoppel	495	128
A. Introduction	495	128
B. Equitable Tolling	497	128
C. Equitable Estoppel	500	—
D. Administrative Estoppel	501	—
 CHAPTER 23. JUDICIAL JURISDICTION, TIMELINESS, AND VENUE	 503	 131
I. Requirements for Suit Filing	503	—
II. State and Federal Agency Exhaustion	504	—
A. Overview	504	—
B. Federal EEOC Exhaustion	504	—
C. State FEP Agency Exhaustion	505	—
D. Concurrent Exhaustion—Dual Filing	506	—
E. The <i>Oscar Mayer</i> Decision	507	—
III. Scope of Charge v. Scope of Complaint	509	—
A. General Rule	509	—
B. Additional Alleged Adverse Employment Actions	510	—
C. Additional Bases of Discrimination	511	—
D. Additional Defendants	512	—
IV. Availability of Preliminary Injunctive Relief Before Expiration of Deferral Period	 512	 —
V. Notification of Right to Bring Suit	513	—
VI. Right-to-Sue Notice Not Jurisdictional Prerequisite	514	—
VII. Timely Filing of Private Civil Action—90 Days From Notice of Right to Sue	 515	 132
A. General Rule	515	—
B. When 90 Days Starts to Run	516	132
C. What Constitutes “Commencement of a Suit”	519	—
D. Tolling and Equitable Modification of the Filing Period	519	132
E. Waiver of the 90-Day Filing Period	521	—
F. Laches	521	—
VIII. Venue	522	—

PART VII. ADEA LITIGATION

 CHAPTER 24. DISCOVERY	 525	 135
I. Scope of the Decisional Unit	525	—
A. The Individual Case	525	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. The Pattern or Practice Case	527	—
C. Organizational Scope of Decisionmakers	528	—
II. Time Period Limitations	529	135
III. Discovery Issues Concerning Third Parties	530	—
IV. Bifurcation of Discovery	532	—
 CHAPTER 25. EVIDENCE	 533	 137
I. Introduction	534	—
II. Evidence Giving Rise to an Inference of Age Discrimination	534	138
A. Age-Related Comments	534	138
1. Overview	534	138
2. Comments as Direct Evidence of Discrimination	535	138
3. Comments as Circumstantial Evidence of Discrimination	537	139
a. Comments Deemed “Stray Remarks” Insufficient to Support Inference of Discrimination	537	139
b. Comments as Circumstantial Evidence Sufficient to Support Inference of Discrimination	540	140
c. Admissibility at Trial of Age-Related Comments	542	—
4. “Ambiguous” Comments	544	140
5. Hearsay Objections to Admissibility of Comments	548	—
B. Age-Based Discriminatory Conduct Towards Other Employees	549	140
C. Employer’s Proposed Severance Agreement	551	141
D. Age of the Decisionmaker	552	—
E. Positive and Adverse Employment Actions by “Same Actor”	552	141
F. Age of Replacement	553	141
G. Employer Hiring Pattern	554	142
H. Events Subsequent to Adverse Employment Actions	554	142
I. Employment Documents That List Employees’ Ages	555	142
J. Deviation from Employer’s Own Seniority System or Personnel Policy	557	143
K. Plaintiffs’ Charts and Diagrams	557	—
III. Lay Opinion Testimony	558	—
IV. Financial Considerations	559	—
V. EEOC Administrative Files and Findings	561	143
A. Admissibility of Evidence Obtained by EEOC	561	143
B. Admissibility of EEOC Determinations	562	143
VI. Evidentiary Effects of Arbitration Proceedings	563	—
VII. Evidence of Willful Violation of the ADEA	563	144
 CHAPTER 26. STATISTICAL EVIDENCE	 567	 145
I. History	567	145
A. Statistical Evidence in Discrimination Litigation	567	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. Statistical Demographics of an Aging Workforce	570	145
II. Admissibility and Weight of Statistical Evidence	572	146
A. General Rule	572	—
B. Sample Size	572	146
C. Degree of Disparity	574	146
D. Similarly Situated Sample for Comparison	576	147
III. Statistical Evidence in Adverse Impact Age Discrimination Cases	580	148
A. Overview	580	—
B. Prima Facie Case	581	148
IV. Statistical Evidence in Disparate Treatment Age Discrimination Cases	585	149
A. Overview	585	—
B. Prima Facie Case	588	149
C. Pretext	588	—
CHAPTER 27. SUMMARY JUDGMENT	591	151
I. The Role of Summary Judgment	592	152
II. Summary Judgment Standard	592	152
A. Overview	592	152
B. Standards of Sufficiency of Evidence to Defeat Summary Judgment	593	—
C. Genuineness of Dispute Over Material Facts	594	—
D. Evaluating Evidence of Intent or Motive	595	153
E. Shifting Burdens of Proof in ADEA Cases	596	—
III. Summary Judgment Against Claims Based on Direct Evidence	597	154
A. Overview	597	—
B. Statements Indicating Discriminatory Animus	598	154
IV. Summary Judgment and Statistical Evidence	602	155
V. Summary Judgment Against Claims Based on Circumstantial Evidence	603	156
A. The <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Burden-Shifting Framework	603	—
B. The Prima Facie Case	604	156
1. Protected Group Status	606	—
2. Meets Legitimate Job Expectations	606	156
3. Adverse Employment Action	607	156
a. Enough Action	607	—
b. Sufficiency of Evidence	609	156
4. Significantly Younger Person	609	157
5. Causal Connection	610	—
C. Employer's Legitimate Nondiscriminatory Reasons	611	158
D. Plaintiff's Rebuttal Showing Reasons Are Pretext for Discrimination	613	158
1. Overview	613	158

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
2. Failure to Hire or Promote Cases	616	—
a. Reliance on Subjective Criteria	616	—
b. Employer’s Good Faith	618	—
3. Discharge Cases	618	159
a. Unsatisfactory Job Performance	618	159
b. Employee’s Misconduct	622	—
c. Employer’s Good Faith Belief	622	—
4. RIF Cases	624	159
 CHAPTER 28. JURY TRIALS	 627	 161
I. Statutory Framework	627	—
A. The FLSA Provisions	627	—
B. FLSA Section 16—Right to Jury Trial	628	—
C. FLSA Section 17—No Right to Jury Trial	630	—
D. ADEA Section 15(c) Suits Against the Federal Government—No Right to Jury Trial	631	—
II. The Roles of Judge and Jury in Determining Remedies	631	161
A. Injunctive Relief	631	—
B. Back Pay	632	161
C. Front Pay	634	162
D. Liquidated Damages	634	162
III. Jury Instructions	637	162
A. The <i>McDonnell Douglas</i> Paradigm	637	162
B. Inference of Discrimination	641	—
C. Willfulness	642	163
D. Mixed-Motive	643	163
E. Standard for Review	644	—
IV. Jury Selection	644	—
 CHAPTER 29. EXPERT WITNESSES	 645	 165
I. Introduction	645	—
II. Admissibility of Expert Witness Testimony	646	—
A. Pre- <i>Daubert</i> Admissibility of Expert Testimony	646	—
B. Admissibility of Expert Testimony Under <i>Daubert</i>	648	—
C. Application of <i>Daubert</i> to Nonscientific Evidence	650	—
D. <i>Daubert</i> -Related Amendments to Rules of Evidence	651	—
III. Use of Expert Witnesses in ADEA Cases	652	166
A. Application of <i>Daubert</i> in ADEA Cases	652	—
B. <i>Hazen Paper Co. v. Biggins</i>	654	—
C. Statistical Experts in ADEA Cases	654	166
1. Overview	654	166
2. Disparate Treatment Cases	656	—
3. Adverse Impact Cases	659	—
D. Economic Damage Experts	661	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
1. Overview	661	—
2. Back Pay	661	—
3. Front Pay	662	—
E. Employment Practices and Human Resource Experts	663	166
F. Experts on Age Stereotyping	664	—
IV. Awards of Expert Witness Fees Under the ADEA	666	—
A. Overview	666	—
B. <i>Crawford Fitting Co. v. J.T. Gibbons Inc.</i>	666	—
C. <i>West Virginia University Hospitals Inc. v. Casey</i>	667	—
D. The Prevailing View That ADEA Expert Fees Are Not Recoverable	668	—
CHAPTER 30. DEFENSES	671	167
I. Overview	672	—
II. ADEA Statutory Defenses	673	168
A. Bona Fide Occupational Qualification—Section 4(f)(1)	673	—
B. Good Cause and Reasonable Factors Other Than Age— Sections 4(f)(1) & (3)	676	168
1. Introduction	676	—
2. Good Cause—Section 4(f)(3)	677	—
3. Reasonable Factor Other Than Age—Section 4(f)(1)	678	168
a. Nature of RFOA Defense	678	168
b. Significance of RFOA Defense to Disparate Treatment Theory	681	—
c. Significance of RFOA Defense to Adverse Impact Theory	682	—
C. Foreign Laws or Exemption Exception—Section 4(f)(1)	684	—
D. Bona Fide Seniority System—Section 4(f)(2)(A)	685	—
E. Bona Fide Employee Benefit Plan—Sections 4(f)(2)(B) and 4(l)	687	—
1. Nature of Defense	687	—
2. EEOC Cost-Justification Rule—Section 4(f)(2)(B)(i)	688	—
3. Early Retirement Incentives—Section 4(f)(2)(B)(ii)	689	—
F. Firefighters and Law Enforcement Officers—Section 4(j) ...	694	—
G. Good Faith Reliance on Administrative Actions— Section 7(e)	695	—
III. Sovereign Immunity	696	—
IV. Preemption	700	—
V. Preclusion and Collateral Estoppel	701	168
A. Preclusive Effect of Prior State Proceedings	701	—
1. State Court Judgments and Reviewed State Administrative Decisions	701	—
2. Unreviewed State Administrative Decisions	705	—
B. Preclusive Effect of Prior Federal Proceedings	705	168

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
C. Preclusive Effect of Arbitration Decisions	708	—
D. Preclusive Effect of Consent Decrees	709	—
VI. Laches	710	—
CHAPTER 31. EEOC LITIGATION	711	169
I. Litigation Authority	711	169
II. Administrative Prerequisites to Suit	713	—
A. Administrative Charge	713	—
B. Attempt to Conciliate	714	—
III. Relationship Between EEOC Suits and Private Suits	715	—
A. Preemption of Unfiled Private Suit by EEOC Suit	715	—
B. Right of EEOC to Intervene in Private Suit	716	—
IV. Statute of Limitations	717	—
V. Class Cases	718	—
VI. Relationship Between EEOC and Complainants	719	—
VII. Remedies	719	—
VIII. Attorneys' Fees	720	—
IX. Effect of Arbitration Agreements	721	170
CHAPTER 32. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE LITIGATION	723	171
I. Federal Employee Litigation	723	172
A. Coverage	723	172
B. Administrative Exhaustion and Notice	725	—
1. Requirement of Exhaustion and Notice	725	—
2. Administrative Procedure for Mixed EEOC/MSPB Cases	726	—
3. Procedure When EEOC Has Exclusive Jurisdiction	728	—
4. Administrative Procedures for Class Complaints	731	—
5. Employees Covered by Collective Bargaining Agreements	733	—
6. Employees of Congress	733	—
7. Presidential Appointees	735	—
C. Application of the Adverse Impact Theory	736	—
D. Litigation Issues	738	172
1. Timeliness	738	172
2. The Defendant	740	—
3. The Trial	740	172
4. Employer Defenses	741	—
5. Class Actions	743	—
6. Venue	743	—
E. Remedies Available to Federal Employees	744	—
F. Attorneys' Fees	745	—
II. State and Local Employee Litigation	745	173
A. Coverage	745	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. Scope of Prohibited Practices	746	—
C. Sovereign Immunity	746	173
D. Local Employees	748	—
E. Application of Adverse Impact Theory [New Topic]	—	173
F. Remedies [New Topic]	—	173
 CHAPTER 33. COLLECTIVE ACTIONS	 749	 175
I. ADEA Collective Actions Governed by FLSA Provisions	749	176
II. Opt-In Plaintiffs	751	176
A. The Opt-In Requirement	751	176
B. Timeliness	752	176
1. Timely Charge Filing With the EEOC	752	176
2. Timeliness of Opting In	754	177
C. Tolling the Limitations Period	755	177
D. Notice to Potential Opt-In Plaintiffs	757	—
E. Necessity of Plaintiffs Being “Similarly Situated”	759	177
1. Overview	759	—
2. Two-Stage Approach	761	177
a. Notice Stage	761	177
b. Decertification Stage	763	178
3. <i>Shushan v. University of Colorado</i>	764	—
III. Precertification Discovery	765	—
IV. Class Determination Hearing	766	—
A. Setting and Timing of Hearing	766	—
B. Inquiry Into the Merits	767	—
C. Evidence	769	—
D. Appeals	769	—
V. Trial of ADEA Collective Actions	771	—
A. Comparison With Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure	771	—
B. Appointment of Special Master	772	—
VI. Settlement	772	—
A. Overview	772	—
B. Precertification Settlements Under Title VII	773	—
C. Settlement Procedure Under the ADEA	774	—
D. Distribution of Settlement Proceeds	776	—

PART VIII. ALTERNATIVE FORMS OF CONFLICT RESOLUTION

 CHAPTER 34. SETTLEMENT AND RELEASE	 781	 183
I. Introduction	782	—
II. Factors Considered in Seeking a Release	783	—
III. ADEA Releases	784	184
A. Knowing and Voluntary Contract	784	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. Older Workers Benefit Protection Act Requirements for ADEA Releases	786	184
1. The Release Must Be Clearly Set Forth in Writing	787	184
2. The Release Must Specifically Refer to ADEA Rights	788	—
3. Future ADEA Rights May Not Be Waived	788	—
4. Additional Consideration Must Be Paid for the Release	790	—
5. The Employee Must Be Advised to Consult an Attorney	791	—
6. Time-to-Consider Requirements	791	—
a. Beginning of Period	792	—
b. Effect of Releases Signed Before Period Expires	792	—
c. Time to Consider Whether to Resign	792	—
7. Revocation Period	793	—
C. Special OWBPA Requirements for ADEA Releases in Group Termination Programs	793	185
1. Overview	793	—
2. Voluntary versus Involuntary Programs	794	—
3. Definition of “Program”	795	—
4. Phased RIFs	796	—
5. Statistical Data	796	185
a. General Disclosure Requirements	796	—
b. Definition of “Decisional Unit”	797	185
c. Scope of Disclosures	799	185
d. Statistics That Change Over Time	799	—
e. Disclosure of Coerced Resignations	799	—
f. Manner of Delivery of Statistical Data	799	—
g. Correction of Statistical Disclosures	800	—
D. Exceptions to the Required Time-to-Consider Period, Right of Revocation, and Statistical Disclosure Requirements	801	—
E. Effect of an OWBPA-Defective Release	801	186
1. Defective Releases Cannot Bar ADEA Claims	801	—
2. Other Potential Consequences of Defective Releases	805	186
F. Tender-Back Regulation by EEOC	806	—
CHAPTER 35. ARBITRATION	809	187
I. The Enforceability of Individual Agreements to Arbitrate	809	187
II. The “Knowing and Voluntary” Waiver Standard	811	188
III. Requirements Imposed on Individual Arbitration Agreements	813	189
A. Fee Splitting and Fee Shifting Provisions [New Topic]	—	189
B. Limitations Periods [New Topic]	—	190
C. Provisions Limiting Discovery [New Topic]	—	190
D. Severability [New Topic]	—	191
IV. Exclusion Under FAA for Contracts of Employment	814	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
V. Effect of Individual Arbitration Agreements on EEOC Actions	815	191
VI. Scope of Review	815	192
 PART IX. ALTERNATIVE AVENUES OF RELIEF 		
CHAPTER 36. FEDERAL AND STATE CONSTITUTIONAL BASES FOR AGE DISCRIMINATION ACTIONS	819	197
I. Overview	820	—
II. Fourteenth Amendment, Equal Protection Claims	821	—
A. Equal Protection Standards	821	—
B. Rational Relation Test Applied to Age-Based Classifications	823	—
1. Mandatory Retirement Programs	824	—
2. Maximum Age for Hire and Pension Plan Participation	824	—
3. Policies Having Adverse Age-Based Impact	825	—
III. Equal Protection Claims by State and Municipal Employees Under Section 1983	826	—
A. Overview	826	—
B. Deprivation of Federal Right Without Other Remedy	826	—
C. Action Under Color of State Law	827	—
D. Persons Liable	829	—
1. Individuals	829	—
2. Municipalities	830	—
3. States	831	—
E. Proof of Equal Protection Claim	831	—
F. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies	834	—
G. Jury Trials for Section 1983 Claims	835	—
H. Statute of Limitations	835	—
I. Remedies Under Section 1983	836	—
IV. Actions by Federal Employees	838	—
V. ADEA Exclusivity	839	198
A. ADEA as the Exclusive Remedy for Age Discrimination Claims	839	198
B. View That ADEA Does Not Bar Equal Protection Claims	841	198
VI. Immunity	844	198
A. Sovereign Immunity	844	198
B. Other Grants of Immunity	845	—
VII. Age Discrimination Claims Under State Constitutions	848	—
CHAPTER 37. THE COMMON LAW	853	199
I. Overview	853	—
II. ADEA Exclusivity	853	199

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
III. Wrongful Discharge in Violation of Public Policy	854	200
IV. Breach of Employment Contract	856	201
V. Breach of the Covenant of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	858	201
VI. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress	859	201
VII. Interference with Contract or Prospective Economic Advantage	861	—
VIII. Supplemental Federal Jurisdiction Over Common Law Claims	863	202
 CHAPTER 38. COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS AND UNION OBLIGATIONS	 867	 203
I. Overview	867	204
II. Structure of CBA Arbitration	868	—
III. Arbitration Challenges to Employer’s Adverse Employment Decisions and Available Remedies	869	—
IV. Arbitration Challenges to Discriminatory CBA Provisions	870	—
V. Relationship Between Arbitration and the ADEA	871	204
A. The Use of ADEA Precedents in Arbitration	871	—
B. CBA Arbitration of Statutory Claims of Age Discrimination	871	—
C. Right of Individuals Covered by CBA to Sue for Age Discrimination	872	204
1. Introduction	872	204
2. <i>Gardner-Denver</i> and <i>Gilmer</i>	873	—
3. <i>Wright v. Universal Maritime Service Corp.</i>	874	—
4. Post- <i>Wright</i> Decisions: Defining the “Clear and Unmistakable” Standard	875	204
5. Enforceability of CBA Waivers that are “Clear and Unmistakable”	876	—
6. Railway Labor Act Preemption [New Topic]	—	206
VI. Judicial Review	877	—
A. Standard of Review	877	—
B. Award Beyond Arbitrator’s Authority	877	—
C. Award Violates Public Policy	878	—
D. Award Manifestly Disregards the Law	878	—
VII. Union Obligations	879	207
A. Duty of Fair Representation	879	207
B. Obligations Under the ADEA	880	—

PART X. RESOLUTION

CHAPTER 39. REMEDIES	885	211
I. Introduction	885	—
II. Back Pay	886	211
A. Overview	886	—

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
B. Back-Pay Accrual	888	211
C. Deductions from Back Pay	889	212
III. Injunctive Relief	890	212
A. Overview	890	212
B. Preliminary Injunctive Relief	890	—
C. Permanent Injunctive Relief	891	213
D. Reinstatement	891	213
IV. Front Pay	893	213
V. Liquidated Damages	894	213
VI. Compensatory Damages	897	213
VII. Punitive Damages	898	—
VIII. Prejudgment Interest	898	214
CHAPTER 40. ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS	901	215
I. Attorneys' Fees in Private ADEA Litigation	901	215
A. Introduction	901	—
B. Prevailing Defendants Not Entitled to Attorneys' Fees Under the ADEA	903	215
C. Fees to Prevailing Plaintiffs	904	215
1. Requirement That Plaintiff Prevail	904	215
2. Mandatory Nature of Fees	904	—
3. Fees in any "Action"	905	—
II. Attorneys' Fees in Federal Sector ADEA Actions	906	216
III. Attorneys' Fees in EEOC ADEA Litigation	907	—
IV. <i>Price Waterhouse</i> Defense As Precluding Award of Attorneys' Fees	908	—
V. Expert Witness Fees	909	—
VI. Effect of Rule 68 on ADEA Attorneys' Fees Awards	911	—
CHAPTER 41. TAX TREATMENT OF AWARDS AND SETTLEMENTS	913	217
I. Recovery of Lost Earnings	913	—
II. Federal Income Tax Withholding and FICA	914	—
III. Payor of Wages Must Deduct, and Pay the IRS, Federal Income and FICA Tax	915	—
IV. Emotional Distress Recovery Is Gross Income But Not Wages for Purposes of Federal Income Tax Withholding and FICA	916	—
V. Tax Effects of Direct Payments to Plaintiff's Attorney	917	217
A. Payment to Attorney Not Wages to Plaintiff	917	—
B. Whether Payment to Attorney Is Income to Plaintiff	917	217
VI. Substance Versus Form	919	—
PART XI. APPENDICES		
APPENDIX A. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT, 29 U.S.C. §§621–634	923	—

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

xli

	<i>Main Volume</i>	<i>Supple- ment</i>
APPENDIX B. SUPREME COURT CASES	941	—
APPENDIX C. EEOC REGULATIONS	1183	—
APPENDIX D. EEOC GUIDANCES	1227	—
APPENDIX E. GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEE RIGHTS ACT OF 1991	1411	—
APPENDIX F. SAMPLE RELEASE FORMS	1415	—
APPENDIX G. REVENUE RULINGS	1449	—
TABLE OF CASES	1457	219
TABLE OF AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT AND AMENDMENTS PROVISIONS	1539	—
INDEX	1541	—